

Jerold D. Friedman (SBN:
290434)
jerry@lawofficejdf.com
LAW OFFICE of JEROLD D.
FRIEDMAN
9620 S. Las Vegas Blvd. E4
#209
Las Vegas, NV 89123
Tel: (213) 536-1244
Fax: (281) 667-3506

Attorney for Plaintiffs

HYDEE FELDSTEIN SOTO, City Atty (SBN:
106866)
DENISE C. MILLS, Chief Deputy City Atty
(SBN: 191992)
KATHLEEN KENEALY, Chief Asst. City
Atty (SBN: 212289)
GABRIEL S. DERMER, Assistant City Atty
(SBN: 229424)
CARR A. TEKOSKY, Deputy City Atty (SBN:
293767)
JOSEPH S. PERSOFF, Deputy City Atty
(SBN: 307986)
200 North Main Street, Room 675
Los Angeles, CA 90012
Tel: (213) 978-7560
Fax: (213) 978-7011
E-mail: *joseph.persoff@lacity.org*

Attorneys for Defendants

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

THESE PONIES ARE MISERABLE,
et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CITY OF LOS ANGELES, et al.,
Defendants.

Case No. 2:23-cv-8330-HDV-SK
Related to Case No.: 2:21-cv-09653

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER

1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3 (Filing Protected Material), below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

The parties acknowledge that this case is likely to involve the exchange of private information, including information concerning plaintiffs and third parties such as identity documents and other personal identifying information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential materials and information consist of, among other things, Criminal Offender Record Information, information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery

1 materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep
2 confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of
3 such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling
4 at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such
5 information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information
6 will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so
7 designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential,
8 non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public
9 record of this case.

10 11 2. DEFINITIONS

12 2.1 Action: *These Ponies are Miserable, an unincorporated association, et*
13 *al., vs. City of Los Angeles, et al.*, No. 2:23-cv-8330-HDV-SK; Related
14 to Case No. 2:21-cv-09653

15 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
16 of information or items under this Order.

17 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
18 how it is generated, stored, or maintained) or tangible things that qualify
19 for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as
20 specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

21 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
22 support staff).

23 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
24 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
25 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

26 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
27 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained
28 (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible

things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, including support staff.

2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.

2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

1 3. SCOPE

2 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
3 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
4 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
5 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
6 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

7 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
8 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

9
10 4. DURATION

11 Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the information that was designated as
12 confidential or maintained pursuant to this protective order becomes public and will
13 be presumptively available to all members of the public, including the press, unless
14 compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are
15 made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. See Kamakana v. City and County of
16 Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing “good cause”
17 showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons”
18 standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the
19 terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

20
21 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

22 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

23 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
24 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
25 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
26 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
27 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
28 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept

1 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

2 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
3 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
4 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
5 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
6 Party to sanctions.

7 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
8 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
9 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

10 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
11 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of Section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
12 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
13 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
14 produced.

15 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

16 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
17 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
18 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
19 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
20 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
21 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
22 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

23 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for
24 inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has
25 indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the
26 inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for
27 inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has
28 identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must

1 determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this
2 Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must
3 affix the “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material.
4 If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the
5 Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
6 appropriate markings in the margins).

7 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify
8 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
9 deposition all protected testimony.

10 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and
11 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on
12 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
13 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information
14 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
15 protected portion(s).

16 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
17 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
18 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
19 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
20 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
21 Order.

22 23 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

24 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
25 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
26 Scheduling Order.

27 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party Shall initiate the dispute
28 resolution process under Civil Local Rule 37-1 et seq.

1 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
2 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
3 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
4 parties), may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
5 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
6 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it
7 is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
8 challenge.

9
10 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

11 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
12 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
13 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
14 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under
15 the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
16 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section 13 below (FINAL
17 DISPOSITION).

18 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at
19 a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the
20 persons authorized under this Order.

21 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless
22 otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
23 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
24 "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

25 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
26 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
27 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

28 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of

1 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

2 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
3 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
4 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

5 (d) the Court and its personnel;

6 (e) court reporters and their staff;

7 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
8 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
9 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

10 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
11 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

12 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in
13 the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing
14 party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2)
15 they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
16 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
17 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed
18 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may
19 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except
20 as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

21 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
22 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

23
24 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED
25 IN OTHER LITIGATION

26 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
27 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
28 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

1 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
2 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

3 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
4 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
5 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include
6 a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

7 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
8 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

9 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
10 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
11 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
12 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
13 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
14 protection in that court of its confidential material, and nothing in these provisions
15 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
16 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

17
18 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
19 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

20 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
21 Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
22 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
23 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
24 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

25 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
26 produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
27 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s
28 confidential information, then the Party shall:

1 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
2 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
3 with a Non-Party;

4 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
5 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
6 specific description of the information requested; and

7 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-
8 Party, if requested.

9 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this Court within
10 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
11 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
12 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
13 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
14 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the Court.
15 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and
16 expense of seeking protection in this Court of its Protected Material.

17
18 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

19 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
20 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
21 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
22 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
23 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person
24 or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this
25 Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and
26 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the Court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in Section 4 (DURATION), within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed; and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

//

//

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
2
3

4 Dated: December 9, 2024

LAW OFFICE OF JEROLD D. FRIEDMAN

5
6 By: /s/ Jerold D. Friedman
Attorney for Plaintiffs

7
8 Dated: December 9, 2024

HYDEE FELDSTEIN SOTO, City Attorney
DENISE C. MILLS, Chief Deputy City Attorney
KATHLEEN KENEALY, Chief Asst. City Attorney
GABRIEL S. DERMER, Assistant City Attorney
JOSEPH S. PERSOFF, Deputy City Attorney
CARR A. TEKOSKY, Deputy City Attorney

9
10
11 By: /s/ Joseph S. Persoff
12 Joseph S. Persoff
13 Deputy City Attorney
14 Attorneys for Defendants

15 Pursuant to L.R. 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i) all other Signatories Listed, and on whose behalf
16 the filing is submitted, concur in the filing's content and have authorized the filing.

17 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.
18

19 DATED: 12/9/2024
20

21 

22 Honorable Steve Kim
23 United States Magistrate Judge
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
_____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury
that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that
was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California
on [date] in the case of *These Ponies Are Miserable, et al., v. City of Los Angeles,*
et al., United States District Court for the Central District of California Case No.
2:23-cv-8330-HDV-SK. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of
this Stipulated Protective Order, and I understand and acknowledge that failure to
so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt.
I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item
that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in
strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print
or type full name] of _____ [print or type
full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in
connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this
Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____